

An Ethics Primer



Lesson ideas and ethics background

Funded by “Collaborations to Advance Understanding of Science & Ethics”, a Science Education Partnership Award from the National Center for Research Resources, National Institutes of Health, 1R25RR016284-01A2.

© 2008 NWABR
All Rights Reserved

Permission granted for educational use

When citing this Ethics Primer, please use the following citation:
Chowning, J.T., and P. Fraser (2007). *An Ethics Primer*.
Seattle WA: Northwest Association of Biomedical Research.

The Primer is available online at www.nwabr.org.

Primer Development Team

Jeanne Ting Chowning, MS

Education Manager, Northwest Association for Biomedical Research
Program Director, Collaborations to Advance Understanding of Science and Ethics

in conjunction with

Paula Fraser, MLS

Bellevue School District, PRISM Program

Collaborations to Advance Understanding of Science and Ethics

Susanna Cunningham, PhD

Principal Investigator and Professor
Dept. of Biobehavioral Nursing and Health Systems, University of Washington

Susan Adler

Co-Principal Investigator and Executive Director
Northwest Association for Biomedical Research

Mark Windschitl, PhD

Co-Principal Investigator and Assistant Professor
School of Education, University of Washington

Consultants

Laura Bishop, PhD

Ethics Consultant and Program Coordinator
High School Bioethics Curriculum Project, Georgetown University

Lola Szobota, MA, MEd

Professional Development Consultant and Ethics Trainer
District Science Supervisor, Northern Valley High School District, Demarest, NJ

LueRachelle Brim-Atkins, MA

Diversity Consultant, Brim Donahoe and Associates

Curriculum Advisory Committee

Wylie Burke, MD, PhD

Professor and Chair, Department of Medical History and Ethics
University of Washington

Mel Dennis, PhD

Professor and Chair, Department of Comparative Medicine
University of Washington

Suzanne Holland, PhD

Associate Professor, Department of Religion, University of Puget Sound

Beverly Torok-Storb, PhD

Senior Scientist, Fred Hutchinson Cancer Research Center

Paul Robertson, PhD

CEO and Scientific Director, Pacific Northwest Research Institute

Pat Wasley, PhD

Dean, College of Education, University of Washington

Professional Development Advisory Committee

Winona Hauge, MSW

Community Outreach Manager, External Relations and Communications
Fred Hutchinson Cancer Research Center

Karen Hoffman

Executive Director, North Carolina Association for Biomedical Research

Carole Kubota, PhD

Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Washington

Wendy Law, PhD

Scientific Liaison, Office of the Director, Fred Hutchison Cancer Research Center

Maureen Munn, PhD

Director, High School Human Genome Program, Department of Genome Sciences
University of Washington

Louisa Stark, PhD

Director, Genetic Science Learning Center, University of Utah

This publication was made possible by the National Center for Research Resources (NCRR), a component of the National Institutes of Health (NIH). Its contents are solely the responsibility of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official views of NCRR, the NIH, or the consultants/advisory board members.

Field Test Teachers

Debbie Alan

Tri-Cities Prep, Tri-Cities, WA

Stella Bass

Washington Middle School, Seattle, WA

James Cooke

Mercer Island High School, Mercer Island, WA

Elise Cooksley

Two Rivers School, North Bend, WA

John Elyard

Trout Lake School District, Trout Lake, WA

Mary Glodowski

Juanita High School, Kirkland, WA

Shannon Hemrich

La Center High School, La Center, WA

Rosetta Lee

Seattle Girls School, Seattle, WA

Dianne Massey

Kentridge High School, Kent, WA

Jodie Mathwig

Kentridge High School, Kent, WA

William Monahan

Eastlake High School, Sammamish, WA

Special Thanks to

Kelly Fryer-Edwards, PhD

Professor, Department of Medical History and Ethics, University of Washington

Carolyn Church Landel, PhD

Project Director, N. Cascades and Olympic Science Project
Western Washington University

Drego Little

Research Assistant, University of Washington

Lori Miller

Graduate Staff Assistant, University of Washington
Genomics Outreach for Minorities Project

La Neu

Graphic Design

Contents

An Ethics Primer



3 Guide to Using the Primer

5 Preface

- 5 What Makes Ethics Unique as a Discipline?
- 5 What Are the Most Important Ideas and Concepts to Teach Students About Ethics?
- 6 How Does Ethics Differ from Morals and Values?
- 7 How Does Ethics Differ from Other Modes of Thinking?
- 9 What is the Relationship Between Science and Ethics?
- 10 Why Incorporate Ethics into Science Classrooms?
- 11 How Does Ethics Relate to National Science Education Standards?
- 12 Key Elements
- 13 Content and Lesson Strategies
- 13 Ethical Perspectives/Theories
- 14 Decision-Making Framework

15 Ethics Background

- 16 Process of Ethical Inquiry
- 18 Background: Ethical Perspectives
- 23 Comparison Chart of Main Ethical Perspectives
- 24 Background Reading for Teachers: More on Virtues
- 27 Background Reading for Students: Ethical Perspectives and Theories

27 Lesson Strategies

- 28 Ethics Classroom Strategies Chart
- 31 Ethics in Science Sample Rubrics and Assessments Chart
- 32 Strategies: Teacher Instructions and Student Handouts
- 114 Sample Assessments And Scoring Guides

123 Decision Frameworks

- 125 Ethical Decision-Making Framework*
- 126 Ethical Decision-Making Framework (4-page version)*
- 130 Ethical Decision-Making Framework Scoring Guide*
- 131 Alternate Decision-Making Framework #1*
- 132 Alternate Decision-Making Framework #2*
- 133 '4-Box Method' for Clinical Decision-making*

135 Appendix

- 137 Model Letter to Parents*
- 138 Topics List for Bioethics*
- 139 Case Study: Pennington's Sweetie Pie*
- 141 Classroom Teaching Example*
- 145 Ethical Analysis of the Case: Pennington's Sweetie Pie*
- 150 Ethical Concerns Regarding Genetic Modification of Organisms*
- 152 Genetic Modification in Medicine*
- 153 Xenotransplantation Time Line*
- 154 Additional Online Resources for the Pennington Case*
- 156 Additional Case Studies*
- 168 Recommended Resources*
- 173 References*

Guide to Using the Primer

An Ethics Primer



Goals and Audience

Most of the secondary science teachers who shy away from incorporating ethics into their curricula are quite clear about the reasons they do so. First, they are uncomfortable with teaching ethics, a subject that science teachers often have very little experience with. Ethics as a discipline is full of unfamiliar terms and its own jargon. Secondly, teachers fear classroom discussions ‘getting out of control’, degenerating into a battle of opinions, or having parents and administrators confuse teaching about values and morals with teaching *particular* values and morals. Lastly, something as seemingly subjective as ethics can be perceived as somewhat out of place in a science classroom, where the focus is ostensibly on objectivity: “Why are we studying values in science class?” Ethics seems like just one more element in an already crowded curriculum. This primer focuses on tools and strategies for overcoming these barriers, as well as some perspective on the importance of addressing the ethical dimensions of science with students.

The primer is designed to *help science teachers in guiding their students to analyze issues in light of the scholarly discipline of ethics*. This Ethics Primer provides classroom-friendly lesson ideas for integrating ethical issues into a science curriculum. It also provides basic background on ethics as a discipline, with straightforward descriptions of major ethical theories. Several decision-making frameworks are included to help students apply reasoned analysis to ethical issues. The primer is designed to be flexible enough to use with many different types of topics and science content.

The primer is *not* intended to be used as a unit from cover to cover. Rather, teachers should review the strategies and resources that seem most suitable for their classes. Although this document is geared towards secondary science teachers, we hope that it will prove of broad value to educators across grade levels and subjects.

Preface

The Preface examines ethics as a unique discipline and outlines the core concepts to convey to students. It introduces one approach for distinguishing between the related terms ‘values’, ‘morals’, and ‘ethics’. Key features distinguishing ethics from other modes of thought are presented, and the relationship between ethics and science is explored. The Preface also provides rationale for teaching ethics in science, and addresses state and national science education standards.

Three key elements are necessary for effective teaching of ethical issues in science - lesson strategies, decision-making models, and student understanding of ethical perspectives and theories. A brief overview of these elements is provided in this section. Each element is further described in its own section of the Primer.

Ethics as a Discipline

This section provides summaries of ethical perspectives and theories that can be utilized in the decision-making process. The Process of Ethical Inquiry flow diagram provides a model for asking ethical questions, gathering relevant background, reasoning through an ethical dilemma, making and acting on a decision, and evaluating the outcome.

Lesson Strategies

This section provides ideas for general approaches to take with students when integrating ethics into the science classroom. An Ethics Classroom Strategies summary chart provides an overview of the approaches featured. In addition, rubrics for assessment/evaluation are presented.

Decision-Making Frameworks

Decision-Making Frameworks provide students with a way to structure their thinking. Elements of a sample decision-making model are discussed in this section. Alternative frameworks are also provided at the end of the text for that section.

Appendix

The Appendix provides resources and background for teachers seeking additional information.