Teaching Background

Rules vs. Outcomes (especially for films)

Summary
Students analyze an issue through the lenses of two of the major ethical perspectives (moral rules/duties vs. outcomes). This strategy is particularly effective for debriefing a documentary film featuring an ethical issue.

Student Handout: Rules vs. Outcomes Argument Analysis

Teacher Instructions
Present a film that explores a complex issue and addresses different perspectives.

Use the 'Rules vs. Outcomes Argument Analysis’ handout for students to record those arguments that are more grounded in the ideas of rights and rules, as compared to those that are focused on outcomes and consequences.

Debrief with the whole class following completion of the film, recording the different perspectives that are discussed.

Modified from Dr. Kelly Fryer-Edwards, University of Washington Department of Medical History and Ethics, 2003
### RULES vs. OUTCOMES Argument Analysis

**Ethical Issue:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arguments from Rules/Duties/Rights</th>
<th>Arguments from Outcomes/Consequences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Which argument do you believe to be the strongest one?

State three reasons why you think the argument you chose is the most compelling.

1. 

2. 

3. 


---

NAME__________________________________________________________ Date___________ Period________

**Student Handout**
**Summary**

Students use a documentary to analyze arguments based on facts/opinions, to analyze pros/cons, and to map arguments to ethical perspectives.

**Student Handout:** Documentary Film Analysis

**Teacher Instructions**

As students watch the documentary, they take note of information and opinions, as well as pro and con arguments presented.

After watching the segment, they hold a discussion with tablemates to make sure that everyone has as many facts, opinions, and arguments as possible. They also try to identify ethical perspectives that are raised by the film.

Finally, students fill out the ‘Know - Learn - Need to Know’ chart to document their progress of learning about the issue and the science behind it.
Documentary Film Analysis

Documentary Title:

Facts vs. Opinions, Pros and Cons, and KLN
1. Watch clip and take notes
2. Discuss for 15-20 minutes and share notes
3. Fill out Know-Learn-Need to know chart for 10 minutes

Central Question:

As you watch the documentary, take note of information and opinions, as well as pro and con arguments presented. After watching the segment, hold a discussion with tablemates to make sure that everyone has as many facts, opinions, and arguments as possible. Try to match ethical perspectives to different arguments. Finally, fill out the Know-Learn-Need to Know chart to document your progress. Use additional sheets if more space is required.

FACTS
(dates, scientific process, numbers and figures, information that has a basis and can be verified)

OPINIONS
(guesses, “what if’s, personal beliefs, information that seems to have no basis or cannot be verified)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARGUMENTS PRO</th>
<th>ARGUMENTS CON</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(some of the arguments that support the “yes” answer to the central question)</td>
<td>(some of the arguments that support the “no” answer to the central question)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Can you identify any ethical principles or perspectives in the arguments above? (For example, are any arguments focused on consequences or outcomes? Do any of them mention our rights, responsibilities, or duties? Are issues related to respect for individuals, doing good/not doing harm, or justice raised?)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KNOW</th>
<th>LEARN</th>
<th>NEED TO KNOW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(what did you know already about this issue before today?)</td>
<td>(what new things did you learn about this issue?)</td>
<td>(what facts do you need to know or need to look up to verify?)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Contributed by Rosetta Lee, Seattle Girls School, Seattle, WA
Summary

Students analyze how the presentation of an issue influences how it is perceived.

Student Handout: Narrative Ethics Film or Story Analysis Sheet

Teacher Instructions

The Narrative Ethics Film or Story Analysis is a straightforward way to allow students to examine some of the underlying messages presented in the media or through literature, and to begin to frame questions that address such messages.

Stress to students that how information is presented influences how it is perceived, and review the Narrative Ethics Film or Story Analysis Sheet with them, highlighting the dimensions of Narrative Ethics.

Allow students to reflect on each of the four dimensions presented in the sheet while they are viewing the film or finishing the text, and discuss each dimension with the class as a whole.

Modified from Dr. Kelly Fryer-Edwards, University of Washington Department of Medical History and Ethics.
Narrative Ethics Film or Story Analysis Sheet

1. Philosophical
What ethical issues arise in the story? What does the story represent or portray?

Who are the characters? For each main character consider their actions, their motives, and their values:

2. Psychological
How do you respond to each of the main characters? (For example, do you like them? Worry about them? Distrust them?)

How does your reaction reflect your values and identity?
3. Aesthetic
How are the following used to tell the story or influence your perception of the issue?

• Language

• Images

• Music

• Metaphors

4. Practical
How does the story relate to your experiences? What have you learned about yourself through the story? How might you use the ethical/moral lessons contained in the story in your own life?

What can be learned about ethical issues related to scientific advances from this story? What lessons about science do you think audiences that didn’t have much science background would take away?