

Rules vs. Outcomes (especially for films)

Summary

Students analyze an issue through the lenses of two of the major ethical perspectives (moral rules/duties vs. outcomes). This strategy is particularly effective for debriefing a documentary film featuring an ethical issue.

Student Handout: Rules vs. Outcomes Argument Analysis

Teacher Instructions

Present a film that explores a complex issue and addresses different perspectives.

Use the 'Rules vs. Outcomes Argument Analysis' handout for students to record those arguments that are more grounded in the ideas of rights and rules, as compared to those that are focused on outcomes and consequences.

Debrief with the whole class following completion of the film, recording the different perspectives that are discussed.

RULES vs. OUTCOMES Argument Analysis

Ethical Issue:

Arguments from Rules/Duties/Rights

Arguments from Outcomes/Consequences

Which argument do you believe to be the strongest one?

State three reasons why you think the argument you chose is the most compelling.

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Documentary Film Analysis

Summary

Students use a documentary to analyze arguments based on facts/opinions, to analyze pros/cons, and to map arguments to ethical perspectives.

Student Handout: Documentary Film Analysis

Teacher Instructions

As students watch the documentary, they take note of information and opinions, as well as pro and con arguments presented.

After watching the segment, they hold a discussion with tablemates to make sure that everyone has as many facts, opinions, and arguments as possible. They also try to identify ethical perspectives that are raised by the film.

Finally, students fill out the 'Know - Learn - Need to Know' chart to document their progress of learning about the issue and the science behind it.

ARGUMENTS PRO

(some of the arguments that support the “yes” answer to the central question)

ARGUMENTS CON

(some of the arguments that support the “no” answer to the central question)

Can you identify any ethical principles or perspectives in the arguments above? (For example, are any arguments focused on consequences or outcomes? Do any of them mention our rights, responsibilities, or duties? Are issues related to respect for individuals, doing good/not doing harm, or justice raised?)

KNOW (what did you know already about this issue before today?)	LEARN (what new things did you learn about this issue?)	NEED TO KNOW (what facts do you need to know or need to look up to verify?)

Narrative Ethics (especially for films/stories)

Summary

Students analyze how the presentation of an issue influences how it is perceived.

Student Handout: Narrative Ethics Film or Story Analysis Sheet

Teacher Instructions

The Narrative Ethics Film or Story Analysis is a straightforward way to allow students to examine some of the underlying messages presented in the media or through literature, and to begin to frame questions that address such messages.

Stress to students that how information is presented influences how it is perceived, and review the Narrative Ethics Film or Story Analysis Sheet with them, highlighting the dimensions of Narrative Ethics.

Allow students to reflect on each of the four dimensions presented in the sheet while they are viewing the film or finishing the text, and discuss each dimension with the class as a whole.

*Modified from Dr. Kelly Fryer-Edwards, University of Washington
Department of Medical History and Ethics.*

Narrative Ethics Film or Story Analysis Sheet

1. Philosophical

What ethical issues arise in the story? What does the story represent or portray?

Who are the characters? For each main character consider their actions, their motives, and their values:

2. Psychological

How do you respond to each of the main characters? (For example, do you like them? Worry about them? Distrust them?)

How does your reaction reflect your values and identity?

3. Aesthetic

How are the following used to tell the story or influence your perception of the issue?

- Language
- Images
- Music
- Metaphors

4. Practical

How does the story relate to your experiences? What have you learned about yourself through the story?
How might you use the ethical/moral lessons contained in the story in your own life?

What can be learned about ethical issues related to scientific advances from this story? What lessons about science do you think audiences that didn't have much science background would take away?